

5.1 Counterexamples

Counterexamples are used to prove that certain statements are false.

For All

EX For all $n \in \mathbb{Z}$, n is even.

This is not true. Consider $n = 5$. The integer 5 is not even.

EX For all $x \in \mathbb{R}$, $|x| = x$.

This is false. Consider $x = -11$. The real number

$x = -11$ ~~is~~ satisfies $|-11| = 11 \neq -11$.

EX For all $x \in \mathbb{R}$, $\frac{x^2+x}{x^2-x} = \frac{x+1}{x-1}$.

Aside: $x=1$ $\frac{1+1}{1-1} \neq \frac{1+1}{1-1}$ because $\frac{2}{0}$ is not defined.

This statement is not true, because when $x=1$

we can't say that $\frac{1+1}{1-1} = \frac{1+1}{1-1}$ since $\frac{2}{0}$ is not defined.

Aside: $\frac{x^2+x}{x^2-x} = \frac{\cancel{x}(x+1)}{\cancel{x}(x-1)} = \frac{x+1}{x-1}$

By dividing $\frac{x}{x}$,
this assumes
 $x \neq 0$

$x=0$ $\frac{0+0}{0-0} \neq \frac{0+1}{0-1} = -1$

$\frac{x^2+x}{x^2-x} = \frac{x+1}{x-1}$ for $x \in \mathbb{R} - \{0, 1\}$

If Then

For all $x \in S$, $P(x) \Rightarrow Q(x)$.
(Let)

This is not true if we can find $x \in S$ such that $P(x) \Rightarrow Q(x)$ is false. This means if $P(x)$ is true and $Q(x)$ is false.

EX Let $n \in \mathbb{Z}$. If n is odd, then $n^2 - n$ is odd.

This is not true. Consider $n = 3$. ~~The integer~~ The integer 3 is odd, but $3^2 - 3 = 6$ is not odd.

Ex Let $a, b \in \mathbb{R} - \{0\}$. If x, y are positive real numbers, then $\frac{a^2}{2b^2} x^2 + \frac{b^2}{2a^2} y^2 > xy$.

Aside: This \neq is false (?). So there must exist x, y such that

$$\frac{a^2}{2b^2} x^2 + \frac{b^2}{2a^2} y^2 > xy$$

is not true.

$$\frac{a^2}{2b^2} x^2 + \frac{b^2}{2a^2} y^2 > xy$$

$$\frac{a^4 x^2 + b^4 y^2}{2a^2 b^2} > xy$$

$$a^4 x^2 + b^4 y^2 > 2a^2 b^2 \cdot xy$$

$$a^4 x^2 - 2a^2 b^2 xy + b^4 y^2 > 0$$

$$\left(\frac{a^2 x}{b^2 y} - 1 \right)^2 > 0$$

$$(a^2 x - b^2 y)^2 > 0$$

Could $a^2 x - b^2 y = 0$? $x = b^2 y = a^2$

This statement is not true. ~~Let~~ Consider $x = b^2$

and $y = a^2$. Since a, b are not 0 ($a, b \in \mathbb{R} - \{0\}$),

$x = b^2$ and $y = a^2$ are positive (not 0). Also

$$\frac{a^2}{2b^2} x^2 + \frac{b^2}{2a^2} y^2 = \frac{a^2 (b^2)^2}{2b^2} + \frac{b^2 (a^2)^2}{2a^2}$$

$$= \frac{a^2 b^4}{2b^2} + \frac{b^2 a^4}{2a^2}$$

$$= \frac{a^2 b^2}{2} + \frac{b^2 a^2}{2}$$

$$= a^2 b^2$$

$$= y \cdot x$$

So $\frac{a^2}{2b^2} x^2 + \frac{b^2}{2a^2} y^2 \not\geq xy$.

5.2 Proof by Contradiction

$$x=2 \text{ and } x \neq 2$$

$$1 > 2$$

$$1 < 2 \text{ and } 2 < 1.$$

These are contradictory statements

A proof by contradiction first assumes what we are trying to prove is false. Then (somehow) use this to arrive at a contradiction.

Ex There is no largest integer.

Proof. Assume this is not the case, that is,

there is a largest integer n . But $n+1$

is also an integer, and

$$n < n+1,$$

so n is not the largest integer. So

by contradiction, there is no largest integer. ■

EX There is no smallest positive ~~integer~~ real number.

Proof. Assume, to the contrary, that there is

a smallest positive real number r . Consider $\frac{r}{2}$.

Since $r > 0$, $r > \frac{r}{2} > 0$. So $\frac{r}{2}$ is

a positive real number smaller than r . So

r is not the smallest real number. This is r

a contradiction, so there is no smallest positive

real number. ■

Ex ~~If $x^2 \mid x$ let $x \in \mathbb{R}$~~ . If x^2 is even, then x is even.
Let $x \in \mathbb{Z}$.

Proof. Assume that this is not true. Then there exists some $x \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that x^2 is even but x is odd. Then $x = 2k+1$ for some $k \in \mathbb{Z}$.

Then
$$x^2 = (2k+1)^2 = 4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1.$$

Since $2k^2 + 2k \in \mathbb{Z}$, this means x^2 is odd.

This is a contradiction, so the statement that if x^2 is even, then x is even must be true. ■

Rational + Irrational Numbers

$\frac{1}{2}, \frac{11}{4}, -\frac{2}{3}, 4, \dots$ rational numbers $\frac{p}{q}$

$\sqrt{2}, \pi,$ irrational? why?

Result $\sqrt{2}$ is irrational.

Proof. Assume to the contrary that $\sqrt{2}$ is rational.

then $\sqrt{2} = \frac{p}{q}$ for some integers p, q . We

can assume without loss of generality that p and q

have no common factors. So

$$\sqrt{2} = \frac{p}{q}$$

tells us

$$\sqrt{2} q = p$$

so

$$2q^2 = p^2.$$

Since $q^2 \in \mathbb{Z}$, this says that p^2 is even. So

p is even. Then $p = 2k$ for some $k \in \mathbb{Z}$.

then

$$2q^2 = (2k)^2$$

So

$$2q^2 = 4k^2$$

then $q^2 = 2k^2$. So q^2 is even. then q is even. But if p and q are both even,

they have a common factor of 2. This is

a contradiction because p, q had no common factors,

So $\sqrt{2}$ is irrational. ■